1		177
2		
3		
4		
5		
6 7	STATE OF WASHINGTON WHATCOM COUNTY SUPERIOR COURT	
8	STATE OF WASHINGTON, DEPARTMENT OF ECOLOGY, NO.14 2 02593 5	
9	CONSENT DECREE Plaintiff,	
10	V.	
11	CITY OF BELLINGHAM, a Washington	
12	municipal corporation; PORT OF BELLINGHAM, a Washington municipal	
13	corporation; WASHINGTON STATE DEPARTMENT OF NATURAL	
14	RESOURCES,	
15	Defendant.	
16	TABLE OF CONTENTS	
17	I. INTRODUCTIONII. JURISDICTION	3 4
18	III. PARTIES BOUND	ر
19	V. FINDINGS OF FACTS	6
20	VII. DESIGNATED PROJECT COORDINATORS	J
21	- LOCEGO	ι4
22	X. SAMPLING, DATA SUBMITTAL, AND AVAILABILITY	ιO
23	XII. RETENTION OF RECORDS	L/
24	XIV. RESOLUTION OF DISPUTES	19
25	XVI. EXTENSION OF SCHEDULE	21
	XVIII. COVENANT NOT TO SUE	22
26	XIX. CONTRIBUTION PROTECTION	

1	XX.		RICTIONS24
2	XXI. XXII.	INDEMNIFICATION COMPLIANCE WI	ON
_	XXIII.	REMEDIAL ACTION	ON COSTS
3	XXIV.		ON OF REMEDIAL ACTION
4	XXVI.	PUBLIC PARTICII	PATION28
5	XXVII.	DURATION OF DI	ECREE
5	XXIX.	EFFECTIVE DATE	E30
6	XXX.	WITHDRAWAL O	OF CONSENT30
7			
8		EXHIBIT A EXHIBIT B	Site Diagram Cleanup Action Plan
9		EXHIBIT C EXHIBIT D	Schedule of Work and Deliverables List of Required Permits
10		EXHIBIT E	Applicable Substantive Requirements of Procedurally Exempt Permits or Approvals
11			
12			
13			
4			
15			
l6 l7			
18			
19			
20			
21			
22			
23			
24			
25			
26			

I. INTRODUCTION

A. The mutual objective of the State of Washington, Department of Ecology (Ecology) and the City of Bellingham (the City), the Port of Bellingham (the Port), and Washington State Department of Natural Resources (DNR) (Defendants) under this Decree is to provide for remedial action at a portion of the Cornwall Avenue Landfill Site (the Site), a facility where there has been a release or threatened release of hazardous substances. The Site consists of three separate Management Units (MUs): MU-1, MU-2, and MU-3. MU-1 is defined as the upland area of the Site as presented on the Site Diagram (Exhibit A). MU-2 is the approximate extent of refuse and wood debris in the aquatic area of the Site subject to active remediation and is shown on the Site Diagram (Exhibit A). MU-3 is the remainder of the aquatic portion of the Site and is described as the potential area of monitored natural recovery that will be further defined at a later date. This Decree requires Defendants to conduct a final cleanup action of the portion of Site that is the subject of this Decree (MU-1 and MU-2), by implementing the Cleanup Action Plan (CAP), attached hereto as Exhibit B. To the extent that further remedial actions are required at MU-3, such actions will be performed under an amendment to this Decree and CAP to address releases or threatened releases of hazardous substances in MU-3.

- B. Ecology has determined that these actions are necessary to protect human health and the environment.
- C. The Complaint in this action is being filed simultaneously with this Decree. An Answer has not been filed, and there has not been a trial on any issue of fact or law in this case. However, the Parties wish to resolve the issues raised by Ecology's Complaint. In addition, the Parties agree that settlement of these matters without litigation is reasonable and in the public interest, and that entry of this Decree is the most appropriate means of resolving these matters.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

1	D.	By signing this Decree, the Parties agree to its entry and agree to be bound by
2	its terms.	
3	E.	By entering into this Decree, the Parties do not intend to discharge non-settling
4	parties from	any liability they may have with respect to matters alleged in the Complaint. The
5.	Parties retain	the right to seek reimbursement, in whole or in part, from any liable persons for
6	sums expend	ed under this Decree.
7	F.	This Decree shall not be construed as proof of liability or responsibility for any
8	releases of h	nazardous substances or cost for remedial action nor an admission of any facts;
9	provided, ho	wever, that Defendants shall not challenge the authority of the Attorney General
10	and Ecology	to enforce this Decree.
11	G.	The Court is fully advised of the reasons for entry of this Decree, and good
12	cause having	been shown:
13	Now,	therefore, it is HEREBY ORDERED, ADJUDGED, AND DECREED as follows:
14		II. JURISDICTION
14 15	A.	II. JURISDICTION This Court has jurisdiction over the subject matter and over the Parties pursuant
İ		
15		This Court has jurisdiction over the subject matter and over the Parties pursuant
15 16	to the Model	This Court has jurisdiction over the subject matter and over the Parties pursuant Toxics Control Act (MTCA), Chapter 70.105D RCW.
15 16 17	to the Model B. RCW 70.105	This Court has jurisdiction over the subject matter and over the Parties pursuant Toxics Control Act (MTCA), Chapter 70.105D RCW. Authority is conferred upon the Washington State Attorney General by
15 16 17 18	to the Model B. RCW 70.105 after public r	This Court has jurisdiction over the subject matter and over the Parties pursuant Toxics Control Act (MTCA), Chapter 70.105D RCW. Authority is conferred upon the Washington State Attorney General by 5D.040(4)(a) to agree to a settlement with any potentially liable person (PLP) if,
15 16 17 18 19	to the Model B. RCW 70.105 after public r to a more ex	This Court has jurisdiction over the subject matter and over the Parties pursuant Toxics Control Act (MTCA), Chapter 70.105D RCW. Authority is conferred upon the Washington State Attorney General by 5D.040(4)(a) to agree to a settlement with any potentially liable person (PLP) if, notice and any required hearing, Ecology finds the proposed settlement would lead
15 16 17 18 19 20	to the Model B. RCW 70.105 after public r to a more ex	This Court has jurisdiction over the subject matter and over the Parties pursuant Toxics Control Act (MTCA), Chapter 70.105D RCW. Authority is conferred upon the Washington State Attorney General by 5D.040(4)(a) to agree to a settlement with any potentially liable person (PLP) if, notice and any required hearing, Ecology finds the proposed settlement would lead peditious cleanup of hazardous substances. RCW 70.105D.040(4)(b) requires that
15 16 17 18 19 20 21	to the Model B. RCW 70.105 after public r to a more expected a settler C.	This Court has jurisdiction over the subject matter and over the Parties pursuant Toxics Control Act (MTCA), Chapter 70.105D RCW. Authority is conferred upon the Washington State Attorney General by 5D.040(4)(a) to agree to a settlement with any potentially liable person (PLP) if, notice and any required hearing, Ecology finds the proposed settlement would lead peditious cleanup of hazardous substances. RCW 70.105D.040(4)(b) requires that ment be entered as a consent decree issued by a court of competent jurisdiction.
15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	to the Model B. RCW 70.105 after public r to a more expected a settler C.	This Court has jurisdiction over the subject matter and over the Parties pursuant Toxics Control Act (MTCA), Chapter 70.105D RCW. Authority is conferred upon the Washington State Attorney General by 5D.040(4)(a) to agree to a settlement with any potentially liable person (PLP) if, notice and any required hearing, Ecology finds the proposed settlement would lead peditious cleanup of hazardous substances. RCW 70.105D.040(4)(b) requires that ment be entered as a consent decree issued by a court of competent jurisdiction. Ecology has determined that a release or threatened release of hazardous
15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23	to the Model B. RCW 70.105 after public r to a more ex such a settler C. substances ha	This Court has jurisdiction over the subject matter and over the Parties pursuant Toxics Control Act (MTCA), Chapter 70.105D RCW. Authority is conferred upon the Washington State Attorney General by 5D.040(4)(a) to agree to a settlement with any potentially liable person (PLP) if, notice and any required hearing, Ecology finds the proposed settlement would lead peditious cleanup of hazardous substances. RCW 70.105D.040(4)(b) requires that ment be entered as a consent decree issued by a court of competent jurisdiction. Ecology has determined that a release or threatened release of hazardous as occurred at the Site that is the subject of this Decree.

- E. The actions to be taken pursuant to this Decree are necessary to protect public health and the environment.
 - F. This Decree has been subject to public notice and comment.
- G. Ecology finds that this Decree will lead to a more expeditious cleanup of hazardous substances at a portion of the Site described as MU-1 and MU-2 in compliance with the cleanup standards established under RCW 70.105D.030(2)(e) and Chapter 173-340 WAC.
- H. Defendants have agreed to undertake the actions specified in this Decree and consents to the entry of this Decree under MTCA.

III. PARTIES BOUND

This Decree shall apply to and be binding upon the Parties to this Decree, their successors and assigns. The undersigned representative of each party hereby certifies that he or she is fully authorized to enter into this Decree and to execute and legally bind such party to comply with this Decree. Defendants agree to undertake all actions required by the terms and conditions of this Decree. No change in ownership or corporate status shall alter Defendants' responsibility under this Decree. Defendants shall provide a copy of this Decree to all agents, contractors, and subcontractors retained to perform work required by this Decree, and shall ensure that all work undertaken by such agents, contractors, and subcontractors complies with this Decree.

IV. DEFINITIONS

Unless otherwise specified herein, all definitions in RCW 70.105D.020 and WAC 173-340-200 shall control the meanings of the terms in this Decree.

A. <u>Site</u>: The Site is referred to as the Cornwall Avenue Landfill and is generally located at the south end of Cornwall Avenue in Bellingham, Washington. The Site is more particularly described in the Site Diagram (Exhibit A). The Site is defined by the extent of contamination caused by the release of hazardous substances at the Site. The final in-water

3	located further out from shore than the MO-2 boundary shown on the Site Diagram, The Site
4	constitutes a Facility under RCW 70.105D.020(8).
5	B. <u>Parties</u> : Refers to the Ecology and the City, the Port, and DNR.
6	C. <u>Defendants</u> : Refers to the Port, the City, and DNR.
7	D. <u>Consent Decree or Decree</u> : Refers to this Consent Decree and each of the
8	exhibits to this Decree. All exhibits are integral and enforceable parts of this Consent Decree.
9	The terms "Consent Decree" or "Decree" shall include all exhibits to this Consent Decree.
10	E. <u>Site Management Unit (MU)</u> : Refers to separate portions of the Cornwall
11	Avenue Landfill Site that are the subject of this Consent Decree. MU-1 and MU-2 are the
12	only portions of the Site addressed by this Consent Decree.
13	F. <u>MU-1</u> : Refers to the upland area of the Site as presented on the Site Diagram
14	(Exhibit A). MU-1 is subject to this Consent Decree.
15	G. <u>MU-2</u> : Refers to the approximate extent of refuse and wood debris in the
16	aquatic area of the Site subject to active remediation and is shown on the Site Diagram
17	(Exhibit A). MU–2 is subject to this Consent Decree.
18	H. <u>MU-3</u> : Refers to the remainder of the aquatic portion of the Site and is
19	described as the potential area of monitored natural recovery that will be further defined at a
20	later date.
21	V. FINDINGS OF FACTS
22	Ecology makes the following findings of fact without any express or implied
23	admissions of such facts by Defendants.
24	A. The Site is located in Bellingham, Washington, and consists of approximately
25	25.8 acres. The Site is bounded by the Burlington Northern Santa Fe right-of-way to the east
26	and in part by the RG Haley Site to the north. The Site also extends across state lands
ı	

|| boundary has not been established for the Site pending the development of final

bioaccumulative sediment cleanup levels. The final in-water Site boundary is expected to be

26

(GP), including sublease of the DNR-owned land.

In July 1976 DNR executed harbor area lease no. 22-002353 to Brook-

Richards, Inc. The lease area included 10.28 acres of harbor area fronting tideland

8.

1

1	sediments (see contaminants of concern below). The hazardous substances are described in
2	detail in the CAP. Methane and other volatile organic compounds may be detected at
3	concentrations of concern in soil vapor during the design phase characterization.
4	D. A series of environmental investigations, beginning in 1993 and extending to
5	2013, confirmed contamination at the Site.
6	E. In 1993, Ecology sampled sediment and shoreline seeps at the Site.
7	F. In 1995, Ecology conducted a Site Hazard Assessment, assigned the Site an
8	overall priority ranking of two on a scale of one to five, with one being considered the highest
9	ranking pursuant to MTCA. The Site was added to the Hazardous Sites List that same year.
10	G. In 1996, the Port, in cooperation with the City and DNR, conducted an
11	expanded site investigation including soil, sediment, and groundwater sampling.
12	H. Between 1996 and 2004 the Port, in cooperation with the City and DNR,
13	performed three investigations of the Site under Ecology's Voluntary Cleanup Program. The
14	results of these investigations are contained in the following documents:
15	(i) Landau Associates, 1996, Report, Expanded Site Investigation, Cornwall Avenue
16	Landfill Investigation, Bellingham, Washington.
17	(ii) Landau Associates, 2000, Report, Focused Remedial Investigation/Feasibility
18	Study, Cornwall Avenue Landfill, Bellingham, Washington, October 3, 2000.
19	I. The Port's investigation (listed above) confirmed the presence of hazardous
20	substances in the Site groundwater, surface water, soil and/or sediments in quantities of
21	hazardous substances above state standards that include arsenic, copper, lead, mercury, silver,
22	zinc, cyanide, polychlorinated biphenyls, ("PCBs"), bis(2-ethylhexyl)phthalate, polycyclic
23	aromatic hydrocarbon ("PAH") compounds and fecal coliform.
24	J. In October 2000, Ecology published the Bellingham Bay Comprehensive
25	Strategy Final Environmental Impact Statement which included the Cornwall Site.

25

26

levels are: 1) sediment: cadmium, copper, lead, silver, zinc, bis(2-ethylhexyl)phthalate, total

PCBs, total cPAHs, wood waste; 2) groundwater: ammonia, manganese; and 3) soil: municipal

refuse and interim action sediment are presumed to contain contaminants at concentrations

construction elements:

1	• An upland low-permeability soil cover, including fine-grained sediment
2	stored at MU-1 as part of the interim action described below.
3	 An upland surface cap including various combinations of topsoil,
4	drainage layers, flexible membranes, asphalt and concrete pavement,
5	and buildings.
6	An upland stormwater collection and discharge system.
7	Improvements to the drainage ditch on the Burlington Northern Santa Fe
8	· (BNSF) right-of-way, contingent on approval from BNSF.
9	An upland soil gas collection and discharge system. The collected gas
10	will be treated, as needed, for MU-1 to meet air quality standards.
11	A shoreline stabilization system.
12	A shoreline sand filter beneath the shoreline stabilization system.
13	An in-water sediment cap beyond the shoreline stabilization system.
14	Groundwater and soil gas monitoring wells
15	6. Preparation of a draft Construction Completion Report for Ecology
16	review and approval, followed by preparation of a final Construction Completion report
17	incorporating Ecology's review comments.
18	7. Preparation of a draft Confirmation Monitoring Plan (CMP) for Ecology
19	review and approval, followed by preparation of a final CMP incorporating Ecology's
20	review comments.
21	8. Implementation of the long-term Confirmation Monitoring Plan for
22	monitoring of groundwater, sediment, gas discharge, and habitat replacement.
23	9. Preparation of a draft Operations and Maintenance Plan (O&M Plan – or
24	Institutional Controls Plan) for Ecology review and approval, followed by preparation of
25	a final O&M Plan incorporating Ecology's review comments.
26	10. Implementation of the long-term O&M Plan.
1	II

2

- 11. As described in more detail in Section XX, an environmental covenant will be recorded after completing the remedial construction that will, among other requirements: prohibit groundwater use and restrict any uses or practices that would damage or reduce the effectiveness of the cleanup action.
- B. Defendants agree not to perform any remedial actions outside the scope of this Decree unless the Parties agree to modify the CAP or Schedule of Work and Deliverables (Exhibits B & C) to cover these actions. All work conducted by Defendants under this Decree shall be done in accordance with Chapter 173-340 WAC unless otherwise provided herein.

VII. DESIGNATED PROJECT COORDINATORS

The Project Coordinator for Ecology is:

Mark Adams 3190 160th Avenue SE Bellevue, Washington 98005 425-649-7107

The Project Coordinator for Defendants is:

Brian Gouran Port of Bellingham 1801 Roeder Avenue Bellingham, Washington 98227 360-676-2500

Each project coordinator shall be responsible for overseeing the implementation of this Decree. Ecology's project coordinator will be Ecology's designated representative for MU-1 and MU-2. To the maximum extent possible, communications between Ecology and Defendants and all documents, including reports, approvals, and other correspondence concerning the activities performed pursuant to the terms and conditions of this Decree shall be directed through the project coordinators. It is the responsibility of the Port's project coordinator to distribute materials to DNR and the City. The project coordinators may designate, in writing, working level staff contacts for all or portions of the implementation of the work to be performed required by this Decree.

Any party may change its respective project coordinator. Written notification shall be given to the other party at least ten (10) calendar days prior to the change.

VIII. PERFORMANCE

All geologic and hydrogeologic work performed pursuant to this Decree shall be under the supervision and direction of a geologist or hydrogeologist licensed by the State of Washington or under the direct supervision of an engineer registered by the State of Washington, except as otherwise provided for by Chapters 18.220 and 18.43 RCW.

All engineering work performed pursuant to this Decree shall be under the direct supervision of a professional engineer registered by the State of Washington, except as otherwise provided for by RCW 18.43.130.

All construction work performed pursuant to this Decree shall be under the direct supervision of a professional engineer or a qualified technician under the direct supervision of a professional engineer. The professional engineer must be registered by the State of Washington, except as otherwise provided for by RCW 18.43.130.

Any documents submitted containing geologic, hydrologic, or engineering work shall be under the seal of an appropriately licensed professional as required by Chapters 18.220 and 18.43 RCW.

Defendants shall notify Ecology in writing of the identity of any engineer(s) and geologist(s), contractor(s) and subcontractor(s), and others to be used in carrying out the terms of this Decree, in advance of their involvement at the Site.

IX. ACCESS

Ecology or any Ecology authorized representative shall have access to enter and freely move about all property MU-1 and MU-2 that Defendants either own, control, or have access rights to at all reasonable times for the purposes of, *inter alia*: inspecting records, operation logs, and contracts related to the work being performed pursuant to this Decree; reviewing Defendants' progress in carrying out the terms of this Decree; conducting such tests or

collecting such samples as Ecology may deem necessary; using a camera, sound recording, or other documentary type equipment to record work done pursuant to this Decree; and verifying the data submitted to Ecology by Defendants. Defendants shall make all reasonable efforts to secure access rights for those properties within the Site not owned or controlled by Defendants where remedial activities or investigations will be performed pursuant to this Decree. Ecology or any Ecology authorized representative shall give reasonable notice before entering any MU–1 or MU–2 property owned or controlled by Defendants unless an emergency prevents such notice. All Parties who access MU–1 or MU–2 pursuant to this section shall comply with any applicable health and safety plan(s). Ecology employees and their representatives shall not be required to sign any liability release or waiver as a condition of Site property access. The scope and terms of Ecology's right of access specified in this section extend to cleanup actions at the adjacent RG Haley and Whatcom Waterway Sites, should the Cleanup Action Plans for those Sites require access to MU–1 or MU–2.

X. SAMPLING, DATA SUBMITTAL, AND AVAILABILITY

With respect to the implementation of this Decree, Defendants shall make the results of all sampling, laboratory reports, and/or test results generated by them or on their behalf available to Ecology. Pursuant to WAC 173-340-840(5), all sampling data shall be submitted to Ecology in both printed and electronic formats in accordance with Section XI (Progress Reports), Ecology's Toxics Cleanup Program Policy 840 (Data Submittal Requirements), and/or any subsequent procedures specified by Ecology for data submittal.

If requested by Ecology, Defendants shall allow Ecology and/or its authorized representative to take split or duplicate samples of any samples collected by Defendants pursuant to the implementation of this Decree. Defendants shall notify Ecology seven (7) days in advance of any sample collection or work activity at the Site. Ecology shall, upon request, allow Defendants and/or their authorized representative to take split or duplicate samples of any samples collected by Ecology pursuant to the implementation of this Decree, provided that

(360) 586-6770

1	doing so does not interfere with Ecology's sampling. Without limitation on Ecology's rights
2	under Section IX (Access), Ecology shall notify Defendants prior to any sample collection
3	activity unless an emergency prevents such notice.
4	In accordance with WAC 173-340-830(2)(a), all hazardous substance analyses shall be
5	conducted by a laboratory accredited under Chapter 173-50 WAC for the specific analyses to
6	be conducted, unless otherwise approved by Ecology.
7	XI. PROGRESS REPORTS
8	Defendants shall submit to Ecology written quarterly Progress Reports that describe the
9	actions taken during the previous quarter to implement the requirements of this Decree. The
.0	Progress Reports shall include the following:
.1	A. A list of on-site activities that have taken place during the quarter;
.2	B. Detailed description of any deviations from required tasks not otherwise
3	documented in project plans or amendment requests;
.4	C. Description of significant deviations from scopes of work or schedules
5	established for the various phases of work necessary to implement the cleanup action during
.6	the current quarter and any planned deviations in the upcoming quarter;
.7	D. For any deviations in schedule, a plan for recovering lost time and maintaining
.8	compliance with the schedule;
9	E. All raw data (including laboratory analyses) received by Defendants during the
20	past quarter and an identification of the source of the sample; and
21	F. A list of deliverables for the upcoming quarter if different from the schedule.
22	All Progress Reports shall be submitted by the tenth (10th) day of the month following
23	the end of the quarter in which they are due starting after the first full quarter following the
24	effective date of this Decree. Unless otherwise specified, Progress Reports and any other
25	documents submitted pursuant to this Decree shall be sent by certified mail, return receipt

requested, to Ecology's project coordinator.

XII. RETENTION OF RECORDS

During the pendency of this Decree, and for ten (10) years from the date this Decree is no longer in effect as provided in Section XXVII (Duration of Decree), Defendants shall preserve all records, reports, documents, and underlying data in its possession relevant to the implementation of this Decree and shall insert a similar record retention requirement into all contracts with project contractors and subcontractors. Upon request of Ecology, Defendants shall make all records available to Ecology and allow access for review within a reasonable time.

Nothing in this Decree is intended by Defendants to waive any right they may have under applicable law to limit disclosure of documents protected by the attorney work-product privilege and/or the attorney-client privilege. If a Defendant withholds any requested records based on an assertion of privilege, that Defendant shall provide Ecology with a privilege log specifying the records withheld and the applicable privilege. No MU–1 or MU–2 related data collected pursuant to this Decree shall be considered privileged.

XIII. TRANSFER OF INTEREST IN PROPERTY

No voluntary conveyance or relinquishment of title, easement, leasehold, or other interest in any portion of the Site shall be consummated by Defendants without provision for continued operation and maintenance of any containment system, treatment system, and/or monitoring system installed or implemented pursuant to this Decree.

Prior to a Defendant's transfer of any interest in all or any portion of MU-1 or MU-2, and during the effective period of this Decree, that Defendant shall provide a copy of this Decree to any prospective purchaser, lessee, transferee, assignee, or other successor in said interest; and, at least thirty (30) days prior to any transfer, that Defendant shall notify Ecology of said transfer. Upon transfer of any interest, the transferring Defendant shall notify all transferees of the restrictions on the activities and uses of the property under this Decree and incorporate any such use restrictions into the transfer documents.

XIV.	RESOLUTION	N OF	DISP	UTES
nto diam	uta ariana na ta a	n onn	1	d:

1

2

5

6

7 8

9

10 11

12 13

14 15

16

17 18

19

20 21

22

23

25

26

24

A. In the event a dispute arises as to an approval, disapproval, proposed change, or other decision or action by Ecology's project coordinator, or an itemized billing statement under Section XXIII (Remedial Action Costs), the Parties shall utilize the dispute resolution procedure set forth below.

- 1. Upon receipt of Ecology's project coordinator's written decision, or the itemized billing statement, Defendants' project coordinator has fourteen (14) days within which to notify Ecology's project coordinator in writing of Defendants' objection to the decision or itemized statement.
- 2. The Parties' project coordinators shall then confer in an effort to resolve the dispute. If the project coordinators cannot resolve the dispute within fourteen (14) days, Ecology's project coordinator shall issue a written decision.
- 3. A Defendant may then request regional management review of the decision. This request shall be submitted in writing to the Northwest Regional Toxics Cleanup Program Section Manager within seven (7) days of receipt of Ecology's project coordinator's written decision.
- 4. Ecology's Regional Section Manager shall conduct a review of the dispute and shall endeavor to issue a written decision regarding the dispute within thirty (30) days of Defendant's request for review.
- 5. If a Defendant finds Ecology's Regional Section Manager's decision unacceptable, that Defendant may then request final management review of the decision. This request shall be submitted in writing to the Toxics Cleanup Program Manager within seven (7) days of receipt of the Regional Section Manager's decision.
- 6. Ecology's Toxics Cleanup Program Manager shall conduct a review of the dispute and shall endeavor to issue a written decision regarding the dispute within thirty (30) days of a Defendant's request for review of the Regional Section Manager's

4

10

9

11 12

13 14

15

16

17

18 19

20

2122

23

2425

26 Ecology sh

decision. The Toxics Cleanup Program Manager's decision shall be Ecology's final decision on the disputed matter.

- B. If Ecology's final written decision is unacceptable to a Defendant, that Defendant has the right to submit the dispute to the Court for resolution. The Parties agree that one judge should retain jurisdiction over this case and shall, as necessary, resolve any dispute arising under this Decree. In the event a Defendant presents an issue to the Court for review, the Court shall review the action or decision of Ecology on the basis of whether such action or decision was arbitrary and capricious and render a decision based on such standard of review.
- C. The Parties agree to only utilize the dispute resolution process in good faith and agree to expedite, to the extent possible, the dispute resolution process whenever it is used. Where either party utilizes the dispute resolution process in bad faith or for purposes of delay, the other party may seek sanctions.
- D. Implementation of these dispute resolution procedures shall not provide a basis for delay of any activities required in this Decree, unless Ecology agrees in writing to a schedule extension or the Court so orders.

XV. AMENDMENT OF DECREE

The project coordinators may agree to minor changes to the work to be performed without formally amending this Decree. Minor changes will be documented in writing by Ecology.

Substantial changes to the work to be performed shall require formal amendment of this Decree. This Decree may only be formally amended by a written stipulation among the Parties that is entered by the Court, or by order of the Court. Such amendment shall become effective upon entry by the Court. Agreement to amend the Decree shall not be unreasonably withheld by any party.

Defendants shall submit a written request for amendment to Ecology for approval. Ecology shall indicate its approval or disapproval in writing and in a timely manner after the

1	written request for amendment is received. If the amendment to the Decree is a substantial
2	change, Ecology will provide public notice and opportunity for comment. Reasons for the
3	disapproval of a proposed amendment to the Decree shall be stated in writing. If Ecology does
4	not agree to a proposed amendment, the disagreement may be addressed through the dispute
5	resolution procedures described in Section XIV (Resolution of Disputes).
6	XVI. EXTENSION OF SCHEDULE
7	A. An extension of schedule shall be granted only when a request for an extension
8	is submitted in a timely fashion, generally at least thirty (30) days prior to expiration of the
9	deadline for which the extension is requested, and good cause exists for granting the extension.
10	All extensions shall be requested in writing. The request shall specify:
11	1. The deadline that is sought to be extended;
12	2. The length of the extension sought;
13	3. The reason(s) for the extension; and
14	4. Any related deadline or schedule that would be affected if the extension
15	were granted.
16	B. The burden shall be on Defendants to demonstrate to the satisfaction of Ecology
17	that the request for such extension has been submitted in a timely fashion and that good cause
18	exists for granting the extension. Good cause may include, but may not be limited to:
19	1. Circumstances beyond the reasonable control and despite the due
20	diligence of Defendants including delays caused by unrelated third parties or Ecology,
21	such as (but not limited to) delays by Ecology in reviewing, approving, or modifying
22	documents submitted by Defendants;
23	2. Acts of God, including fire, flood, blizzard, extreme temperatures,
24	storm, or other unavoidable casualty; or
25	3. Endangerment as described in Section XVII (Endangerment).

25

26

In the event Defendants determine that any activity being performed at MU-1 or

MU-2 under this Decree is creating or has the potential to create a danger to human health or

the environment, Defendants may cease such activities. Defendants shall notify Ecology's

project coordinator as soon as possible, but no later than twenty-four (24) hours after making such determination or ceasing such activities. Upon Ecology's direction, Defendants shall provide Ecology with documentation of the basis for the determination or cessation of such activities. If Ecology disagrees with Defendants' cessation of activities, it may direct Defendants to resume such activities.

If Ecology concurs with or orders a work stoppage pursuant to this section, Defendants' obligations with respect to the ceased activities shall be suspended until Ecology determines the danger is abated, and the time for performance of such activities, as well as the time for any other work dependent upon such activities, shall be extended, in accordance with Section XVI (Extension of Schedule), for such period of time as Ecology determines is reasonable under the circumstances.

Nothing in this Decree shall limit the authority of Ecology, its employees, agents, or contractors to take or require appropriate action in the event of an emergency.

XVIII. COVENANT NOT TO SUE

A. Covenant Not to Sue: In consideration of Defendants' compliance with the terms and conditions of this Decree, Ecology covenants not to institute legal or administrative actions against Defendants regarding the release or threatened release of hazardous substances covered by this Decree.

This Decree covers only MU-1 or MU-2 specifically identified in the Site Diagram (Exhibit A) and those hazardous substances that Ecology knows are located at MU-1 or MU-2 as of the date of entry of this Decree, in addition to methane and other volatile organic compounds that may be detected at concentrations of concern in soil vapor during the design phase characterization. In the event of an amendment to this Decree or a reopener under Section XVIII(B), those areas of MU-2 subject to a sediment cap, sand filter, or cap pursuant to the CAP will not be required to be excavated, disturbed or otherwise modified to further address contamination unless that contamination originates from MU-1 and/or

(360) 586-6770

2	of its authority relative to any substance or area, including but not limited to MU-3, not
3	covered by this Decree.
4	This Covenant Not to Sue shall have no applicability whatsoever to:
5	1. Criminal liability;
6	2. Liability for damages to natural resources; and
7	3. Any Ecology action, including cost recovery, against PLPs not a party to
8	this Decree.
9	If factors not known at the time of entry of this Decree are discovered and present a
10	previously unknown threat to human health or the environment, the Court shall amend this
11	Covenant Not to Sue.
12	B. Reopeners: Ecology specifically reserves the right to institute legal or
13	administrative action against Defendants to require them to perform additional remedial
14	actions at MU-1 or MU-2 and to pursue appropriate cost recovery, pursuant to
15	RCW 70.105D.050 under the following circumstances:
16	1. Upon Defendants' failure to meet the requirements of this Decree,
17	including, but not limited to, failure of the remedial action to meet the cleanup standards
18	identified in the Cleanup Action Plan (CAP) (Exhibit B);
19	2. Upon Ecology's determination that remedial action beyond the terms of
20	this Decree is necessary to abate an imminent and substantial endangerment to human
21	health or the environment;
22	3. Upon the availability of new information regarding factors previously
23	unknown to Ecology, including the nature or quantity of hazardous substances at the
24	Site, and Ecology's determination, in light of this information, that further remedial
25	action is necessary at the Site to protect human health or the environment; or

1 | MU-2. This Decree does not cover any other hazardous substance or area. Ecology retains all

- 4. Upon Ecology's determination that additional remedial actions are necessary to achieve cleanup standards within the reasonable restoration time frame set forth in the CAP.
- C. Except in the case of an emergency, prior to instituting legal or administrative action against Defendants pursuant to this section, Ecology shall provide Defendants with fifteen (15) calendar days' notice of such action.

XIX. CONTRIBUTION PROTECTION

With regard to claims for contribution against Defendants, the Parties agree that Defendants are entitled to protection against claims for contribution for matters addressed in this Decree as provided by RCW 70.105D.040(4)(d).

XX. LAND USE RESTRICTIONS

In consultation with Defendants, Ecology will prepare an Environmental (Restrictive) Covenant consistent with WAC 173-340-440 and Chapter 64.70 RCW. After approval by Ecology, each Defendant shall record an Environmental (Restrictive) Covenant with the office of the Whatcom County Auditor within ninety (90) days of completing the cleanup action. Each Environmental (Restrictive) Covenant shall restrict future activities and uses of the Site as agreed to by Ecology and each Defendant. Defendants shall provide Ecology with each original recorded Environmental (Restrictive) Covenant within thirty (30) days of the recording date.

XXI. INDEMNIFICATION

Defendants agree, to the extent permitted by law, to indemnify and save and hold the State of Washington, its employees, and agents harmless from any and all claims or causes of action (1) for death or injuries to persons, or (2) for loss or damage to property to the extent arising from or on account of acts or omissions of Defendants, their officers, employees, agents, or contractors in entering into and implementing this Decree. However, Defendants shall not indemnify the State of Washington nor save nor hold its employees and agents

harmless from any claims or causes of action to the extent arising out of the negligent acts or omissions of the State of Washington, or the employees or agents of the State, in entering into or implementing this Decree.

XXII. COMPLIANCE WITH APPLICABLE LAWS

- A. All actions carried out by Defendants pursuant to this Decree shall be done in accordance with all applicable federal, state, and local requirements, including requirements to obtain necessary permits, except as provided in RCW 70.105D.090. The permits or other federal, state, or local requirements that the agency has determined are applicable and that are known at the time of entry of this Decree have been identified in Exhibit D.
- B. Pursuant to RCW 70.105D.090(1), Defendants are exempt from the procedural requirements of Chapters 70.94, 70.95, 70.105, 77.55, 90.48, and 90.58 RCW and of any laws requiring or authorizing local government permits or approvals. However, Defendants shall comply with the substantive requirements of such permits or approvals. The exempt permits or approvals and the applicable substantive requirements of those permits or approvals, as they are known at the time of entry of this Decree, have been identified in Exhibit E.

Defendants have a continuing obligation to determine whether additional permits or approvals addressed in RCW 70.105D.090(1) would otherwise be required for the remedial action under this Decree. In the event either Ecology or Defendants determine that additional permits or approvals addressed in RCW 70.105D.090(1) would otherwise be required for the remedial action under this Decree, it shall promptly notify the other party of this determination. Ecology shall determine whether Ecology or Defendants shall be responsible to contact the appropriate state and/or local agencies. If Ecology so requires, Defendants shall promptly consult with the appropriate state and/or local agencies and provide Ecology with written documentation from those agencies of the substantive requirements those agencies believe are applicable to the remedial action. Ecology shall make the final determination on the additional substantive requirements that must be met by Defendants and on how Defendants must meet

26 of

those requirements. Ecology shall inform Defendants in writing of these requirements. Once established by Ecology, the additional requirements shall be enforceable requirements of this Decree. Defendants shall not begin or continue the remedial action potentially subject to the additional requirements until Ecology makes its final determination.

C. Pursuant to RCW 70.105D.090(2), in the event Ecology determines that the exemption from complying with the procedural requirements of the laws referenced in RCW 70.105D.090(1) would result in the loss of approval from a federal agency that is necessary for the state to administer any federal law, the exemption shall not apply and Defendants shall comply with both the procedural and substantive requirements of the laws referenced in RCW 70.105D.090(1), including any requirements to obtain permits.

XXIII. REMEDIAL ACTION COSTS

Defendants shall pay to Ecology costs incurred by Ecology pursuant to this Decree and consistent with WAC 173-340-550(2). These costs shall include work performed by Ecology or its contractors for, or on, the Site under Chapter 70.105D RCW, including remedial actions and Decree preparation, negotiation, oversight, and administration. These costs shall include work performed both prior to and subsequent to the entry of this Decree. Ecology's costs shall include costs of direct activities and support costs of direct activities as defined in WAC 173-340-550(2). Ecology has accumulated \$13,849.14 in remedial action costs related to this facility as of March 31, 2014. Payment for this amount shall be submitted within thirty (30) days of the effective date of this Decree. For all costs incurred subsequent to March 31, 2014 Defendants shall pay the required amount within thirty (30) days of receiving from Ecology an itemized statement of costs that includes a summary of costs incurred, an identification of involved staff, and the amount of time spent by involved staff members on the project. A general statement of work performed will be provided upon request. Itemized statements shall be prepared quarterly. Failure to pay Ecology's costs within ninety (90) days of receipt of the itemized statement of costs will result in interest charges at the rate of twelve

percent (12%) per annum, compounded monthly, to the extent authorized by WAC 173-340-550(4).

In addition to other available relief, pursuant to RCW 70.105D.055, Ecology has authority to recover unreimbursed remedial action costs by filing a lien against real property subject to the remedial actions.

XXIV. IMPLEMENTATION OF REMEDIAL ACTION

If Ecology determines that Defendants have failed without good cause to implement the remedial action, in whole or in part, Ecology may, after notice to Defendants, perform any or all portions of the remedial action that remain incomplete. If Ecology performs all or portions of the remedial action because of Defendant's failure to comply with their obligations under this Decree, Defendants shall reimburse Ecology for the costs of doing such work in accordance with Section XXIII (Remedial Action Costs), provided that Defendants are not obligated under this section to reimburse Ecology for costs incurred for work inconsistent with or beyond the scope of this Decree.

Except where necessary to abate an emergency situation, Defendants shall not perform any remedial actions at MU-1 or MU-2 outside those remedial actions required by this Decree, unless Ecology concurs, in writing, with such additional remedial actions pursuant to Section XV (Amendment of Decree).

XXV. PERIODIC REVIEW

As remedial action, including groundwater monitoring, continues at MU-1 or MU-2, the Parties agree to review the progress of remedial action at MU-1 or MU-2, and to review the data accumulated as a result of monitoring MU-1 or MU-2 as often as is necessary and appropriate under the circumstances. At least every five (5) years after the initiation of cleanup action at MU-1 or MU-2 the Parties shall meet to discuss the status of MU-1 or MU-2 and the need, if any, for further remedial action at MU-1 or MU-2. At least ninety (90) days prior to each periodic review, Defendants shall submit a report to Ecology that documents whether

human health and the environment are being protected based on the factors set forth in WAC 173-340-420(4). Ecology reserves the right to require further remedial action at MU-1 or MU-2 under appropriate circumstances. This provision shall remain in effect for the duration of this Decree.

XXVI. PUBLIC PARTICIPATION

A Public Participation Plan is required for this Site. Ecology shall review any existing Public Participation Plan to determine its continued appropriateness and whether it requires amendment, or if no plan exists, Ecology shall develop a Public Participation Plan alone or in conjunction with Defendants. Ecology shall maintain the responsibility for public participation at the Site. However, Defendants shall cooperate with Ecology, and shall:

- A. If agreed to by Ecology, develop appropriate mailing lists, prepare drafts of public notices and fact sheets at important stages of the remedial action, such as the submission of work plans, remedial investigation/feasibility study reports, cleanup action plans, and engineering design reports. As appropriate, Ecology will edit, finalize, and distribute such fact sheets and prepare and distribute public notices of Ecology's presentations and meetings.
- B. Notify Ecology's project coordinator prior to 'the preparation of all press releases and fact sheets, and before major meetings with the interested public and local governments. Likewise, Ecology shall notify Defendants prior to the issuance of all press releases and fact sheets, and before major meetings with the interested public and local governments. For all press releases, fact sheets, meetings, and other outreach efforts by Defendants that do not receive prior Ecology approval, Defendants shall clearly indicate to its audience that the press release, fact sheet, meeting, or other outreach effort was not sponsored or endorsed by Ecology.
- C. When requested by Ecology, participate in public presentations on the progress of the remedial action at the Site. Participation may be through attendance at public meetings to assist in answering questions, or as a presenter.

2	the following locations:
3	1. Ecology's Bellingham Field Office 1440 10 th Street, Suite 102 Bellingham, WA 98225-7028
5 6	2. Ecology's Northwest Regional Office 3190 160 th Ave. SE Bellevue, WA 98008-5452
7 8	3. Bellingham Public Library 210 Central Avenue Bellingham, WA 98225
9 10	At a minimum, copies of all public notices, fact sheets, and documents relating to public
11	comment periods shall be promptly placed in these repositories. A copy of all documents related to this Site shall be maintained in the repository at Ecology's Northwest Regional
12	Office in Bellevue, Washington.
13	XXVII. DURATION OF DECREE
14	The remedial program required pursuant to this Decree shall be maintained and
15	continued until Defendants have received written notification from Ecology that the
16	requirements of this Decree have been satisfactorily completed. This Decree shall remain in
17	effect until dismissed by the Court. When dismissed, Section XVIII (Covenant Not to Sue)
18	and Section XIX (Contribution Protection) shall survive.
19	XXVIII. CLAIMS AGAINST THE STATE
20 21	Defendants hereby agree that they will not seek to recover any costs accrued in
22	implementing the remedial action required by this Decree from the State of Washington or any
23	of its agencies. Defendants will make no claim against the State Toxics Control Account or
24	any local Toxics Control Account for any costs incurred in implementing this Decree. Except
	as provided above, however, Defendants expressly reserve their right to seek to recover any
25	costs incurred in implementing this Decree from any other PLP. This section does not limit or

When requested by Ecology, arrange and/or continue information repositories at

1

26

D.

1	address funding that may be provided under Chapter 173-322 WAC. This section is not
2	intended to limit the Legislature's authority to appropriate funds.
3	XXIX. EFFECTIVE DATE
4	This Decree is effective upon the date it is entered by the Court.
5	XXX. WITHDRAWAL OF CONSENT
6	If the Court withholds or withdraws its consent to this Decree, it shall be null and void
7	at the option of any party and the accompanying Complaint shall be dismissed without costs
8	and without prejudice. In such an event, no party shall be bound by the requirements of this
9	Decree.
10	
11	STATE OF WASHINGTON ROBERT W. FERGUSON
12	DEPARTMENT OF ECOLOGY Attorney General
13	Much I had
14	JAMES PENDOWSKI Program Manager ANNE M. POWELL, WSBA #42934 Assistant Attorney General
15	Toxics Cleanup Program (360) 586-4607 (360) 407-7177
16	Date Signed: 11/19/14
17	Date Signed. With the signed.
18	•
19	STATE OF WASHINGTON ROBERT W. FERGUSON DEP'T OF NATURAL RESOURCES Attorney General
20	The state of the s
21	PETER GOLDMARK CHRISTA L. THOMPSON, WSBA #15431
22	Commissioner of Public Lands Sr. Counsel for DNR (360) 902-1004 (360) 586-3511
23	Date Signed: 10/23/2014 Date Signed: 10-21-2014
24	
25	
26	

1	CITY OF BELLINGHAM	PORT OF BELLINGHAM
2 3 4 5	KELL/LINVILLE Mayor, City of Bellingham (360) 778-8100	ROBERT FIX Executive Director (360) 676-2500 Date Signed: 1027/14
6 7 8	APPROVED AS TO FORM:	
.9		7
10 11	ATTEST: Suam Ombauli Finance Director	/
12	Date Signed: 10/24/2014	
13		
14	ENTERED this day of <u>DEC - 7</u>	2014.
1.4	L	(1)14
15		
		DAVID M. THORN
. 15	JUI	
15 16	FUL Wha	DAVID M. THORN GE. Commissione
15 16 17	What	DAVID M. THORN GE. Commissione
15 16 17 18	Wha	DAVID M. THORN GE. Commissione
15 16 17 18 19	Wha	DAVID M. THORN GE. Commissione
15 16 17 18 19 20	JUI Wha	DAVID M. THORN GE. Commissione
15 16 17 18 19 20 21	JUI Wha	DAVID M. THORN GE. Commissione
15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	JUE Wha	DAVID M. THORN GE. Commissione
15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23	What	DAVID M. THORN GE. Commissione