



Waste 2 Resources Program

Executive Summary Report Priorities for WRRLCA 30% Funding Waste 2 Resources Advisory Committee

Introduction

In June 2012, the Washington Department of Ecology's (Ecology) Waste 2 Resources (W2R) Program requested the Governor's Office of Regulatory Assistance (ORA) help facilitate meetings for the W2R Advisory Committee (W2RAC). W2RAC, which is composed of a broad cross-section of solid waste stakeholders, provides input to Ecology on solid waste issues.

In 2011 and 2012, the Washington State Legislature passed budget provisos limiting W2R's ability to fund activities under one of their two main funding sources, the Waste Reduction, Recycling, and Litter Control Account (WRRLCA). The provisos were thought to reflect a level of discord among stakeholders in the solid waste industry.

ORA was tasked with planning and facilitating three meetings in July, September and November to help W2RAC find agreement on priorities for spending a portion of the WRRLCA funds; specifically, the 30% dedicated to waste reduction and recycling activities. The overall purpose of each W2RAC meeting was for the committee to agree on priorities for spending the 30% portion of the WRRLCA funds designated for waste reduction and recycling activities.

The following is a summary of the process, progress made, and next steps for W2RAC. All meeting agendas, handouts and notes referenced in this report are available on the <u>W2RAC</u> website.

Preliminary Work

To prepare for W2RAC meetings, ORA conducted a brief email survey of committee members. The survey asked them how they would define success; what their constituent's main needs were regarding waste reduction and recycling activities; and what issues they see as most challenging in finding agreement for use of the 30% of WRRLCA funds. Responses were received from 15 of 33 committee members, which were summarized and helped to design the meetings.

Definitions of success included increased understanding; an open, honest, and representative process; finding some agreement; and forestalling future provisos. Some important issues were waste reduction and recycling; waste facilities; litter; funding and reducing costs; and understanding the bigger picture. Challenges were expected to include policies and potential changes, funding, and different opinions.

W2RAC Meeting – July 17, 2012

At the first ORA-facilitated meeting, W2RAC members expressed their values regarding waste reduction and recycling activities. Common themes included sustainability; protecting and sustaining the environment matching recycling levels to markets; having fair and effective programs; spending money prudently and reliably; and advancement of the state's waste management hierarchy.

The group also defined success for this and future meetings. Definitions of success included to understand, set goals, establish a budget, and agree. At this meeting, additional information was requested on WRRLCA funds overall, activities funded, state statutes, and other sources of funds (i.e., Model Toxics Control Act or MTCA).

W2RAC Webinar – September 13, 2012

As a followup to the July meeting, Ecology provided the requested additional information for the committee and set up a webinar to allow for in-depth discussion. The committee had an opportunity to discuss and better understand the statutory requirements, the state plan recommendations, and how the WRRLCA 30% funds fit in with other funding sources, including the remaining 70% of WRRLCA funds. A record of questions and responses was compiled and distributed to the group following the webinar, along with a copy of the webinar slides.

W2RAC Meeting – September 18, 2012

At the second ORA-facilitated meeting, the committee was asked to share opinions on WRRLCA 30% funded activities. Because a majority of committee members were not familiar with the details of activities, they needed to hear descriptions before they could determine their opinions. Committee members were then requested to provide short statements to explain why they favor or don't favor spending funds on specific activities. More than half of the activities elicited some concerns or "don't favor" responses by some members, although many activities did not.

The group also requested broad-scale information on the level of effort Ecology puts to various activities. The committee felt this was needed to better prepare them for the prioritization of activities planned for the November meeting.

W2RAC Conference Call – November 8, 2012

Ecology prepared additional information on the historic level of effort and adequacy of funding for WRRLCA 30% funded activities as the committee requested at the September meeting. A conference call was held in early November to give committee members the opportunity to discuss relative costs and funding levels for waste reduction and recycling programs. It was emphasized that the WRRLCA 30% funds only represents a small portion of the total W2R budget – about 14%. It was also noted that it is difficult to measure sufficiency of funding levels.

W2RAC Meeting – November 20, 2012

The last of the ORA-facilitated meetings focused on prioritization of activities to be supported by WRRLCA 30% funds using a multi-vote approach, which allowed up to three votes per activity out of a total of 15 votes per person.

For the multi-voting, W2RAC agreed only one person per stakeholder group would vote (e.g., either the primary member or alternative would vote, but not both). Ecology and Utility & Transportation Commission staff did not vote. Votes were compiled from the main meeting room in Lacey and the remote videoconference locations.

Following the meeting, committee members who could not attend were offered an opportunity to vote, and four committee members responded. The late votes raised some activities to a higher ranking than in the meeting. These activities include Financing the Solid Waste System; and Technical Assistance to Locals and Businesses for both organics and recycling. The table of prioritized results, which includes multi-voting data from the November 20 meeting and the additional four members, is provided in Table 1 below.

In the discussion of the multi-voting results, there were comments about how some activities were defined. It was recognized there were different opinions as to what work was included under the activities and for future committee work was needed on some activities.

The committee also examined high, low and mid-level numbers of votes. They acknowledged activities that scored quite high, such as Technical Assistance to Locals and Businesses; Transporting Recyclables; Building Material Reuse & Recycling; Local Solid & Hazardous Waste Planning & Implementation Assistance; and Product-Specific Programs. Although these activities ranked high, support for them was not unanimous. Likewise, although some activities scored quite low (such as Mapping Recycling Facilities; 1-800-RECYCLE Hotline; School Recycling Awards; and Organic Waste to Resources/Fuels Research), there were still advocates for all activities.

It was recognized the W2R Program will make ultimate funding decisions, and that W2RAC's input will figure strongly in those decisions.

Total Votes	Ranking
28	high
28	high
28	high
25	high
24	high
22	med-high
21	med-high
21	med-high
	28 28 28 25 24 22 21

Table 1. W2RAC Priorities for WRRLCA 30% Funds. 1

January 2013

Activities	Total Votes	Ranking
Commingled Recycling Study	20	med-high
Moderate Risk Waste Reduction, Recycling, Safe Handling	20	med-high
Organics Facility Compliance	19	med-high
Packaging	18	med-high
Food Waste Prevention	15	med-low
Environmentally Preferred Purchasing	13	med-low
State Solid Waste Planning (2)	12	med-low
Information Clearinghouse	11	med-low
Composting Education and Training	11	med-low
Anaerobic Digestion	10	med-low
Solid Waste Laws Update	8	low
1-800-RECYCLE Hotline	7	low
Sustainable Building Materials	6	low
Rule Development	6	low
Natural Yard Care	5	low
Waste to Fuels Research	5	low
Green Building Education and Technical Assistance	5	low
Mapping Recycling Facilities	4	low
School Recycling Awards	2	low
Backyard Composting	2	low
Beneficial Use Determination	2	low

Table Notes:

1. The table includes votes tallied on November 20, 2012 and those submitted following the meeting by four committee members who were not able to attend.

2. In the Lacey meeting room, the "state solid waste planning" activity was confused as a heading, so people did not vote for it initially. This confusion was resolved and a hand vote was taken, allowing only one vote per person supporting the activity.

Activities Ranking Summary			
Scale	Count		
High = 24 and over	High – 5		
Med-High = 18 though 23	Med-High – 7		
Med-low = 10 though 18	Med-Low - 6		
Low = 9 and under	Low - 11		

Outcomes and Next Steps

Although W2RAC did not reach full consensus on what waste reduction and recycling activities they would all support through the prioritization activity on November 20, they did achieve a level of understanding on how strongly or weakly the group supports the different activities. This provides valuable input to the W2R Program, which now has a clear record of activities viewed as most important, as well as dissenting opinions.

A list of "parking lot" issues was identified for potential "Next Steps:"

- Discuss limiting funding to only products that pay into WRRLCA.
- Possible subcommittees or further discussion with W2RAC in 2013:
 - o 1-800 recycling hotline "reboot."
 - o School awards "reboot."
 - o State and local plan update timelines.
 - o Green building tools.
 - o Solid waste laws update.
 - o Gaps in activities.
 - o Product-specific programs.
 - o Packaging.

W2RAC voiced a willingness to examine these issues in 2013. This will likely include more detailed review of specific WRRLCA funded activities, which may result in changes that would enable a larger proportion of the committee to support certain activities.

This process provided the W2R Program with helpful input on waste reduction and recycling activities that have committee support for funding with the WRRLCA 30% funds. The W2R Program will consider W2RAC's input in the future as it decides how to distribute the WRRLCA 30% funding among various program activities.

W2RAC Membership and Meeting Attendance

W2RAC Membership Roster:

- Pat Campbell, Senior Program Manager, Kitsap Co Dept. of Public Works
- Sandra Cannon, Walla Walla Area Resource Conservation Committee
- Candy Castellanos, WA State Recycling Assn (Alternate: Rick Hlavka, Green Solutions)
- Ken Colling, President/CEO, Seattle Goodwill Industries (Alternate: Tiffany Hatch)
- Laurie Davies, W2R Program Manager, Washington State Department of Ecology
- Dennis Durbin, Stevens County Public Works
- Gene Eckhardt, Washington Utilities and Transportation Committee (Alternate: Penny Ingram)
- Jan Gee, Washington Food Industry Assn (Alternate: Holly Chisa)
- Terry Gillis, Recovery 1 (Alternate: Stephanie Kassoy, PE, Republic Services Northwest)
- Matt Henry, General Manager, Allied Waste Roosevelt Regional Landfill
- Steven Holderby, Spokane Regional Health District (Alternate: Jeff Martin, Klickitat County Health District)
- Sego Jackson, Snohomish County Public Works
- Kevin Kiernan, Director, Solid Waste Division, King County Solid Waste (Alternate: Bill Reed, King County Solid Waste Division)
- Dean Large, Waste Connections, Inc.
- Craig Lorch, Total Reclaim, Inc.
- Brad Lovaas, WA Refuse & Recycling Assoc. (Alternate: Vicki Christophersen, Christophersen Inc.)
- Rich McConaghy, City of Vancouver (Alternate: Tanya Gray, City of Vancouver)
- Suellen Mele, Program Director, Zero Waste Washington
- Russ Menke, Spokane Regional Solid Waste System
- Wendy Mifflin, Yakima County Solid Waste (Alternate: Patti Johnson, Mgr, Kittitas County Solid Waste)
- Derald Orloff, Yakama Nation
- Cal Palmer, Energy and Environment, LLC
- Mariah Ross, Sustainable Connections Bellingham
- Kimberly Shanley, Waste Management, Inc.
- John Sherman, Acting Chair, Tacoma Pierce County Health Dept
- Jay Simmons, NORPAC (Alternate: Ed Tolan, Nippon)
- Jerry Smedes, Smedes & Associates
- Art Starry, Thurston County Environmental Health
- Danny Joe Stensgar, TSWAN President, Colville Confederated Tribes
- Michael Transue, Construction and Demolition Recycling (Alternate: Preston Horne-Brine, Fluxion Enterprises; WSRA)
- Eddie Westmoreland, Western Region VP of Governmental Affairs, Waste Connections, Inc. (Alternate: Jody Snyder Director of Regulatory Services, Waste Connections, Inc.)
- Scott Windsor, City of Spokane

W2RAC Meeting Attendees - July 17, 2012

Lacey:

Pat Campbell Vicki Christopherson Linda Dennis Laurie Davies Dennis Durbin Jan Gee Rick Hlavka Gene Eckhardt Stephanie Kassoy Kevin Kiernan Suellen Mele Bill Reed John Sherman Jerry Smedes Art Starry Danny Joe Stensgar Scott Windsor

<u>Remote Offices</u>:

Sandra Cannon Tanya Gray Rob Guttridge Steven Holderby Preston Horne-Brine Jeff Martin Rich McConaghy Wendy Mifflin

W2RAC Meeting Attendees - September 18, 2012

Lacey:	Sego Jackson	
Pat Campbell	Stephanie Kassoy	Remote Offices:
Vicki Christopherson	Suellen Mele	Sandra Cannon
Laurie Davies	Bill Reed	Rob Guttridge
Linda Dennis	Kim Shanley	Steven Holderby
Dennis Durbin	Jerry Smedes	Rich McConaghy
Jan Gee	Art Starry	Wendy Mifflin
Matt Henry	Danny Joe Stensgar	
Penny Ingram	Jody Snyder	

W2RAC Meeting Attendees - November 20, 2012

Lacey: Pat Campbell Vicki Christopherson Laurie Davies Linda Dennis Dennis Durbin Gene Eckhardt Jan Gee Matt Henry Rick Hlavka Suellen Mele Sego Jackson Carolyn Logue Cal Palmer Bill Reed John Sherman Jerry Smedes Jody Snyder Art Starry Danny Joe Stensgar

<u>Remote Offices</u>:

Dave Bader Bill Fleck Tanya Gray Rob Guttridge Steven Holderby Preston Horne-Brine Dean Large Troy Lautenbach Rich McConaghy Scott Windsor

Ecology staff Janine Bogar, Lorie Hewitt, and Susanne McLemore attended all meetings. Additional Ecology Staff attended some meetings (Peter Christiansen, Kathy Davie, Darlene Frye, Wayne Krafft, Peter Lyon, Jessica Moore, and Shannon McClelland).

ORA staff Jane Dewell and Jeanne Fulcher provided facilitation.

Publication and Contact Information

This report is available on the Department of Ecology's website at <u>www.ecy.wa.gov/biblio/1307009.html</u>

For more information contact:

Waste 2 Resources Program PO Box 47600 Olympia, WA 98504-7600

Phone: 360-407-6900

Washington State Department of Ecology - <u>www.ecy.wa.gov</u>

0	Headquarters, Olympia	360-407-6000
0	Northwest Regional Office, Bellevue	425-649-7000
0	Southwest Regional Office, Olympia	360-407-6300
0	Central Regional Office, Yakima	509-575-2490
0	Eastern Regional Office, Spokane	509-329-3400

To ask about the availability of this document in a format for the visually impaired, call the Waste 2 Resources Program at 360-407-6900. Persons with hearing loss can call 711 for Washington Relay Service. Persons with a speech disability can call 877-833-6341.